



**The International Umpires Sub-committee met at 1400 - 1900 hours at the Melia Palas Atenea Hotel, Palma, Mallorca, Spain on Monday 3 November 2014**

1. Opening of the Meeting	1	8. Calls & Rules	5
2. Minutes of the previous meeting and Agenda	1	9. Education and Development	5
3. Event Appointments	1	10. Strategy and development	6
4. IU Grouping System	2	11. Race Officials Committee	6
5. Requirements to be an International Umpire	2	12. Submissions	6
6. IU Manual	4	13. Closed Session (closed to observers)	8
7. Addendum Q	5		

### 1. Opening of the Meeting

#### (a) Welcome by the Chairman

The Chairman opened the meeting and welcomed the Sub-committee to Palma.

#### (b) Attendees and Apologies

Apologies had been received from Vice-President Adrienne Greenwood and Shane Borrell. Richard Slater declared a conflict of interest in relation to agenda items 12(b)(i) and (iii).

#### (c) Obituaries

The Sub-committee paid respects following the deaths of Hugh Elliott (USA), Andre Raoult (COK) and Masayuki Ishii (JPN).

### 2. Minutes of the previous meeting and Agenda

#### (a) Minutes

The Sub-committee noted the minutes of the previous International Umpires Sub-committee meeting held on 10 November 2013 (circulated and approved after the meeting).

#### (b) Matters arising

There were no matters arising from those minutes not already covered by this agenda.

### 3. Event Appointments

#### (a) To receive a report from the Event Appointments Working Party.

The Sub-committee received a report from the Event Appointments Working Party. The Competitions Manager added to the report and outlined the close relationship with the Alpari World Match Racing Tour on the appointment of umpires. The Chairman added that several of the events appointed to included medal race umpiring. For Sailing World Cup events, there is now a specific Chief Umpire of Medal Racing appointed by ISAF.

In response to a question from Flavio Naveira concerning the use of IU groupings in appointment decisions, the Competitions Manager said the Working Party was becoming more and more cautious over the use of groupings because of the increasingly limited data they were based on. He said the unfortunate reality, as noted by the Match Racing Committee at its meeting, was that the number of events was decreasing and this in turn affected the viability of the grouping system. The

Competitions Manager went on to say that the proposal for Alpari World Match Racing Tour umpires each year was based on a number of principles such as core consistency, development needs, local and geographical concerns. He said that the use of Group 1 umpires was becoming increasingly difficult because Group 1 is small in numbers and their availability becoming more and more stretched.

The Tour Director explained to the Sub-committee how appointments are put together. He said for the competing teams the key is consistency with the ability to draw through new talent and to develop umpires. He went on to say that grouping is helpful but not the only source of information for appointment and talent identification.

- (b) To review and comment on the procedures of the Event Appointments Working Party.

The Sub-committee had no comments to make on the published procedures of the Event Appointments Working Party.

- (c) To discuss the identification of race officials for development to high level roles at events and to discuss future best practice.

The Chairman deferred discussion of this item to agenda item 9.

#### 4. IU Grouping System

The Sub-committee received a report from the Chairman of the Grouping Panel on the 2013/2014 grouping exercise and discussed the 2014/2015 grouping process.

The Chairman confirmed the question of grouping was one for the Sub-committee to decide. She referenced the discussions earlier in the meeting concerning event appointments and opened the topic for discussion. Richard Slater said the Sub-committee should decide if the value of the grouping system was diminishing and no longer sustainable. The Sub-committee discussed the matter, including the value of grouping if it was only for match racing events and the developing focus of ISAF on umpired fleet racing.

The Chairman informed the Sub-committee that the grouping process suffered from problems when an umpire's grouping has not changed (due to no comments from the Grouping Panel on them) but the umpire wanted feedback on why they had not moved up. The same issue arose in connection with the nature of events – the system is supposed to be based only on match racing events, but the growth of umpired fleet racing meant experience with umpires at these events was inevitably being used by members of the Grouping Panel in forming a view.

The Sub-committee concluded that the current use of the system was no longer feasible and an alternative system should be established as soon as possible.

#### **Decision**

**The IU grouping process for 2014 – 2015 is suspended. The Sub-committee will review alternative performance assessment systems.**

#### 5. Requirements to be an International Umpire

- (a) Principal Event Guidelines

The Sub-committee reviewed the ROC Principal Event Guidelines for International Umpires.

The Sub-committee noted that this item had been listed for discussion due to the increasing importance and prevalence of umpired fleet racing. The Chairman noted that some of the strongest umpires in performance terms now had more fleet racing events than match or team racing ones and she went on to say that the Sub-committee

should address this issue to ensure that umpires are not retiring at the time of re-appointment due to lack of events. Marianne Middelthon supported the Chairman's view and said that umpired fleet racing was becoming far more common.

The Sub-committee agreed there was a need to embrace the other disciplines and have consistency with the application of the Guidelines to umpired fleet racing events. Miguel Allen commented that the taking of immediate decisions on the water was umpiring not judging. He said this can lead to confusion where you can only use the event for one discipline's re-appointment.

Richard Slater said that the question was how the skills are being utilised at the event and then that leads to the appropriate event classification.

The Chairman summarised the discussion and said the comments from the Sub-committee would be helpful in the next agenda items.

The Sub-committee discussed a specific request from the Extreme Sailing Series for principal event status.

### **Decision**

**The Sub-committee confirms the events of the Extreme Sailing Series are principal events for IU applications.**

(b) ISAF Regulation 31.12

The Sub-committee reviewed the requirements for first appointment and re-appointment as an International Umpire. Having formed the view that the requirements for appointment were becoming too hard to achieve in the present event climate, the Sub-committee went on to consider whether to reduce the required number of principal events or to increase the number of events that qualified for principal event status. The Sub-committee considered the spread of events around the world and the current numbers of graded events. The Competitions Manager informed the Sub-committee of the grading numbers issued by the Secretariat in the current year and compared them to the previous four years.

The Chairman said she was in favour of more events that count as a principal event rather than dropping the number of principal events. The Chairman and Richard Slater suggested classifying Grade 3 events which are Grade 3 due to being an international event (i.e. 30% or more international skippers) as being principal events. The Sub-committee agreed with this proposal.

The Chairman raised the development of medal racing, its place in the appointment system and how to quantify the events for appointment decisions. She raised the question of whether one day of medal racing at a Sailing World Cup event is sufficient. Marianne Middelthon noted that Sailing World Cup events tend to be a number of short medal races on one day and suggested that flexibility was needed to some extent. The Sub-committee agreed that applicants need to have certainty over the requirements, particularly applicants for first appointment.

Miguel Allen raised the issue of the reduction in graded events and the consequent difficulty in obtaining the necessary number of events for appointment. He considered that there was confusion in the classification of umpired fleet racing events and how they can be used in applications for International Judge and International Umpire status.

The Sub-committee considered whether the current Guidelines were broad enough or if they needed expanding to take into account umpired fleet racing. The Competitions Manager noted that this could be done with the agreement of Race Officials

Committee. The Sub-committee considered the application forms should be amended to remove references to “match” or “team”.

The Sub-committee discussed the situation with respect to team racing events and it was agreed that a minimum number of days needs to be in place. The Sub-committee also considered that it was important to have consistency in the use of named examples in the Guidance.

Overall, the Sub-committee considered that the requirements of the Regulation and the ROC Principal Event Guidance should be made more flexible in order to permit a range of umpired match, team and fleet racing events to be considered for appointment

### **Decision**

**The Sub-committee will prepare a submission for 2015 for the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee to consider. The Sub-committee will review the Principal Events Guidance and make a recommendation to the Race Officials Committee early in 2015.**

## **6. IU Manual**

### **(a) Match Racing Manual**

The Sub-committee received a report from Marianne Middelthon on the IU Match Racing Manual and noted there were no intended updates at present. The Chairman thanked Marianne for her hard work in this area.

### **(b) Team Racing Manual**

The Sub-committee received a report from the Chairman on the IU Team Racing Clinic held recently in Argentina. As a result of the clinic, the Team Racing Manual is being revised by Chris Atkins and brought into line with the current teaching materials. A draft should be available in early 2015. Following a request from Marianne Middelthon for the consistency of terminology used, the Chairman commented that both manuals should be reviewed to ensure consistency.

### **(c) Umpired Fleet Racing/Medal Racing Manual**

The Sub-committee discussed whether ISAF should develop an IU manual for umpired fleet racing/medal racing. It recognised the significance of other disciplines in this area (in particular, judging) and noted the need for consistency across all areas. The Competitions Manager noted the growing number of advice documents for judges when undertaking medal racing and said that a manual was almost there in all but name. The Chairman noted that following the development of a manual, the next step in the development of the discipline would be a seminar.

The Chairman said a manual should be in place within 12 months. Miguel Allen volunteered to lead a group to prepare this work and the Chairman asked other Sub-committee members to contribute to it as a priority.

### **Decision**

**An IU Fleet Racing Manual will be prepared by the Sub-committee within the next 12 months. The Secretariat will review whether any changes to Regulations are required and report back to the Chairman.**

### 7. Addendum Q

The Sub-committee received a report from the Competitions Manager on behalf of the Chairman of the Addendum Q Working Party. The Competitions Manager noted the number of RRS 86.2 special rule requests that ask to use the Addendum. Marianne Middelthon informed the Sub-committee that amendments are being considered in the near future, including issues concerning redress.

### 8. Calls & Rules

#### (a) Rapid Response Calls

The Sub-committee received a report from Marianne Middelthon as the Chairman of the Rapid Response MR & TR Calls Panel. She noted in particular that this year had seen the issue of the first joint Rapid Response Call in both match racing and team racing. The Sub-committee was also informed of differences in interpretation of team racing rules between umpires from the major team racing nations that have come to light as a result of discussion of calls.

The Sub-committee noted that some proposed urgent rule changes would affect the Call Book. The Competitions Manager was asked about the correct procedure for the processing of umpired fleet racing calls. He advised that at present they must be considered as Q&As but this situation can be reviewed following the Committee's earlier discussions.

#### (b) Rules Development

The Sub-committee received a report from Marianne Middelthon as the Chairman of the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party.

The Sub-committee was informed of the research undertaken by the Match Racing Committee with respect to the rules currently being used by the Alpari World Match Racing Tour. The result of this work, and following liaison with the Chairman of the Racing Rules Committee, was two submissions for consideration this year which may potentially lead to urgent rule changes.

Marianne Middelthon discussed other potential new rules which could go into ISAF standard sailing instructions. She updated the Sub-committee on the review of rule 18, which may move towards the rule used at the last America's Cup and also a review of team racing rules concerning legs of the course.

### 9. Education and Development

#### (a) Seminars and Clinics

- i) The Sub-committee noted the 2014 program of seminars and clinics. The Vice-Chairman updated the Sub-committee on the seminar held in Japan in early 2014 which was successful despite heavy snow. The Sub-committee noted the forthcoming seminar in Thailand and the work being done by the instructors there to standardise pre-seminar documentation and entry procedures. The Chairman noted that the seminar was oversubscribed and the Sub-committee should consider another potential seminar in Asia in 2015.
- ii) The Sub-committee discussed the 2015 program of seminars and clinics. The Chairman reminded the Sub-committee that ISAF was continuing its successful series of team racing clinics in conjunction with the Volvo Ocean Race stopovers. The Competitions Manager said that these, in addition to any Nations Cup clinics that may be run in 2015, may place pressure on the Sub-committee's allocation of

## International Umpires Sub-committee Minutes (cont.)

the budget. The Chairman said she was liaising with the Chairman of the Nations Cup Working Party over the proposals.

### (b) Conferences

There were no proposals for conferences or development seminars in 2015.

## 10. Strategy and development

The Sub-committee received a proposal from Richard Slater concerning the continuing education and development of match racing umpires. His proposal concerned the running a structured development session for a set number of umpires in connection with the Alpari World Match Racing Tour. The Tour supported this proposal.

The Chairman felt this was a good proposal and for the maximum impact should be aimed at those International Umpires who had qualified in the last 3 – 5 years as this will allow upcoming umpires exposure to the best umpires, events and competitors. The process will also help identification of those who may be the top umpires in the future.

The Sub-committee agreed with the principles of the project and Richard Slater agreed to continue working on the proposals.

The Sub-committee discussed other proposals for strategy and development. Following discussion of the use of the Moodle system, the Competitions Manager agreed to obtain sample of television footage from the Tour Director and trial them on the system.

Richard Slater reported to the Sub-committee that he is preparing a report on the use of single umpiring and any changes to the rules and procedures that would be needed for this to work. He emphasised that he had no view on whether the benefits of the system would outweigh the disadvantages, but he felt it was a matter the Sub-committee should discuss. The Chairman said the Sub-committee looked forward to his report at its next meeting.

### **Decision**

**The Sub-committee approves the trial of a development seminar for a number of existing International Umpires in conjunction with a World Match Racing Tour event. Richard Slater is to prepare a final proposal for the Chairman's approval, which is to contain the additional budget request for Race Officials Committee to consider.**

## 11. Race Officials Committee

The Sub-committee had no recommendations to the Race Officials Committee on any areas of its agenda not already considered by the Sub-committee.

## 12. Submissions

- (a) The Sub-committee considered the following submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is the Reporting Committee:
  - i) Submission 109-14 – ISAF Race Officials – New Disciplines, Regulation 6.9.6 from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee  
*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*
  - ii) Submission 110-14 – ISAF Race Officials – Regulation 31 – Race Official Examinations from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee  
*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*
  - iii) Submission 111-14 – ISAF Race Officials – Regulation 32 – Race Official Performance from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*

- iv) Submission 154-14 – Racing Rules of Sailing – Rule 69 from the Chairmen of the Racing Rules Committee, Constitution Committee and Race Officials Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Defer*

- (b) The Sub-committee considered the following submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is an Other Committee except Racing Rules submissions:

- i) Submission 035-13 – Race Officials – Appointments to Events – Regulations 25.8.10, 25.8.13 and 25.8.15 from the Chairman of Constitution Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*

- ii) Submission 001-14 – IFDS Merger with ISAF – New Regulations 5.1(c) and 6.4, Changes to current Regulations and Articles from the Executive Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: No recommendation*

- iii) Submission 013-14 – Appointment of Race Officials to Events – Regulation 25.8 from the Executive Committee and the Chairmen of the Regional Games Committee and Race Officials Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: No recommendation*

- iv) Submission 014-14 – Event Appointments Working Party – Regulation 25.8.2 from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*

- v) Submission 021-14 – Continental Associations to Train and Certify Regional Technical Officers and Race Officials from the Bulgarian Sailing Federation, Sailing Cook Islands, the Cyprus Sailing Federation, the Fiji Yachting Association, the Hungarian Yachting Association, the Yachting Association of India, the Oman Sailing Committee, the Pakistan Sailing Federation, Papua New Guinea Yacht & Boat Association, Qatar Sailing and Rowing Federation, the Russian Yachting Federation, the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation, the Yachting Association of Sri Lanka, UAE Sailing and Rowing Federation.

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Reject*

- vi) Submission 022-14 – Appointment of Technical Delegates and ITOs to Continental Games – Regulation 25.9 from the Bulgarian Sailing Federation, Sailing Cook Islands, the Cyprus Sailing Federation, the Fiji Yachting Association, the Hungarian Yachting Association, the Yachting Association of India, the Oman Sailing Committee, the Pakistan Sailing Federation, Papua New Guinea Yacht & Boat Association, Qatar Sailing and Rowing Federation, the Russian Yachting Federation, the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation, the Yachting Association of Sri Lanka, Swiss Sailing, UAE Sailing and Rowing Federation.

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Reject*

- vii) Submission 037-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – Regulation 35.5 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve*

- viii) Submission 038-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – New Regulation 35.10 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve (2 in favour, 1 against, 4 abstain)*

## International Umpires Sub-committee Minutes (cont.)

- ix) Submission 039-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – Regulation 35.16 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve with the following amendment:*

35.16 A person who has had a sanction imposed on him by the Disciplinary Commission has the right of appeal against that decision to the ISAF Review Board. Any appeal must be lodged in writing with the Chief Executive Officer within 30 days **of being notified of the Commission's written decision** ~~of the publication of the written decision of the Commission.~~

- x) Submission 097-14 – Crew Weight Limit for Women's Match Racing – Regulation 27.2.3(a) and 27.2.3(d) from the Chairman of the Match Racing Committee

Not discussed.

- (c) The Sub-committee had no recommendations to make on submissions on the Racing Rules of Sailing for which the Race Officials Committee is an Other Committee.

### 13. Closed Session (closed to observers)

- (a) Performance Investigations

The Sub-committee received a report from the Competitions Manager on performance investigations.

- (b) Commendations

The Sub-committee had no recommendations for commendations.

- (c) Seminar/Clinic Instructors, Test Administrators and Performance Assessors

The Sub-committee noted the current list and noted the appointment of two new instructors for match racing.

- (d) Race Official Appointments

The Sub-committee considered applications for International Umpire status and made recommendations to the Race Officials Committee.

There being no other business, the meeting was closed.